

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

Shaykh al-Albaanee (رَحْمَةُ اللَّهِ)¹ said in 'Silsilah Ahadeeth As-Saheehah':

2247- 'When the Messenger (صلى الله عليه وسلم)² used to stand in the prayer he would take a hold of his left hand with his right hand.'

Collected by Yaqoob al-Foosee in 'al-Ma'rifah' (3/121) and with the same chain al-Baihaqee narrates it in 'as-Sunnan al-Kubra' (2/28) and Tabaraanee in 'al-Kabeer' (22/9/1) from another chain: Aboo Nu'aem said that Moosa bin Umayr al-Anbaree narrated to us who said that 'Alqama bin Wa'il narrated to me from his father that 'When the Messenger (صلى الله عليه وسلم) used to stand in the prayer he would take a hold of his left hand with his right hand.'

And I saw 'Alqama do this.

Al-Foosi said: 'and Moosa bin Umayr Koofee is Thiqaah (trustworthy).'

I (al-Albaanee) said: and other scholars graded him Thiqaah (trustworthy), the rest of the narrators are also trustworthy from the narrators of Muslim, so the Sanaad (chain of narration) is Saheeh.

It has been collected by Nisaa'ee (1/141) from Abdullaah bin al-Mubarak from Moosa bin Umayr al-Anbaree and Qeess bin Saleem al-Anbaree who both said that 'Alqama bin Wa'il narrated to us with the previous narration and with something similar to that, without mentioning that 'Alqama did the action.

And it was collected by Ahmad (4/316) and Ibn Abee Shaybah in 'al-Musannaf' (1/390) that Wakeea' narrated to us: that Moosa bin Umayr al-Anbaree narrated to us this narration with a summary of the narration with the wording:

'I saw the Messenger of Allaah (صلى الله عليه وسلم) placing his right hand on his left hand in the prayer.'

But he did not mention: while standing in the prayer.

And it was collected by al-Baghawee in 'Sharh as-Sunnah' (3/30) from another chain from Wakeea'.

Likewise, Ahmad (4/316-319) narrated from other chains from Wa'il bin Hajr without mentioning the standing in prayer.

¹ (رَحْمَةُ اللَّهِ) (rahimahullaah) May Allaah the Most High have mercy on him

² (صلى الله عليه وسلم) (sallallaahu 'alayhi wa sallam) May the peace and blessings of Allaah the Most High be upon him

Legislation of placing hands on chest while standing before Rukoo' and not in the standing after

The researcher can have no doubt in the different chains of this hadeeth that the hadeeth is also summarised – as in the narration of Wakeea' – from the hadeeth of Wa'il which explains the description of the Prophet's prayer (صلى الله عليه وسلم), and the standing in the prayer where he would clasp his hands, which is before the Rukoo'. This was mentioned from two chains:

The first: From Abdul Jabbar bin Wa'il from 'Alqama bin Wa'il and their freed slave that they narrated to him from his father Wa'il bin Hajr:

That he saw the Prophet (صلى الله عليه وسلم) raise his hands opposite his ears when he entered into the prayer and said the Takbeer, as was described by Hammam.

Then he gathered his garment (thobe) around him-self.

Then he placed his right hand on his left hand.

When he wanted to perform Rukoo' he took out his hands from his thobe and then he raised his hands, then said Takbeer, then performed Rukoo'.

Then when he said: 'Sami Allaahu liman Hamida.' (Allaah Hears the one who praises Him) he raised his hands.

When he performed Sajda (prostration), he would prostrate between his hands.³

The second narration: from 'Aasim bin Kulayb from his father from Wa'il bin Hajr who said:

'I said: Indeed I want to see the prayer of the Messenger of Allaah (صلى الله عليه وسلم) how he used to pray?

He said: 'The Messenger of Allaah (صلى الله عليه وسلم) stood and faced the Qiblah, said the Takbeer (Allaahu Akbar) and raised his hands until they were opposite his ears.

Then he took his left hand by his right one.

When he wanted to go into Rukoo' he raised his hands like that.

Then he placed his hands on his knees.

Then he raised his head from Rukoo' he raised his hands like that.

So when he prostrated, he placed his head at that place between his hands, then he sat and spread (iftarasha) his left leg..... and indicated with his index finger....' Until the end of the hadeeth.

Collected by Aboo Daawood, Nisaa'ee, Ahmad and others with an authentic Sanaad (chain) and it is collected in 'Saheeh Aboo Daawood' (716-717) with two other narrations from other Imaams from a group of Thiqaat (trustworthy narrators) from 'Aasim, and some of the narrations have extra wording more than others. The most complete sequence of wording is that of Za'idah bin Qadamah

³ Collected by Muslim (2/130), Aboo Awaanah (2/106-107), Ahmad (4/317-318) and al-Baihaqee (2/28 & 71).

Legislation of placing hands on chest while standing before Rukoo' and not in the standing after

and Bashr bin al-Mufadal and he is Thiqata Thabt (trustworthy and firm) and the wording is his, and Ibn Maajah narrates from him with the wording:

'I saw the Prophet (صلى الله عليه وسلم) praying and he took his left hand by his right hand.'

I say (Albaanee): If the researcher reflects upon just this sentence alone, and he does not know, or at the very least does not call to mind that it is summarised from the hadeeth, then he understands from it the legislation of clasping the hands in every standing position in the prayer, whether it was before the Rukoo' or after it.

However, the sequence of the hadeeth illustrates that this is a mistake, since it is clear that this placing of the hands is in the first standing of the prayer, and in the wording of 'Aasim it is clearer, since he mentioned raising of the hands in the Takbeeratul-Ihraam (the opening Takbeer), then he made Rukoo' and raised up from it, then he said in those two narrations: this is how he prayed.

So if Wa'il had memorised that, if the placing of the hands was after Rukoo' , then he would also have mentioned it as is clear, because he mentioned the raising of the hands three times before, but if someone separates that sentence from its sequence in the hadeeth, then it is presumed that it is to place the hands back on the chest after raising from Rukoo'. This is what some of the present-day noble scholars say, without them having a precedence from the Salaf as-Saalih, from what I know.

What confirms what we have mentioned is the narration of Ibn Idrees from 'Aasim with this narration with a summarised wording:

'I saw the Messenger of Allaah (صلى الله عليه وسلم) when he said Takbeer, take his left hand by his right hand.'

Many people fell into this type of presumption due to some narrators mentioning these narrations in a summarised form, or being precise in narrating this hadeeth.

I used to declare in a lot of my lectures and lessons the causes and reasoning regarding this clasping of the hands after Rukoo'; that a person is about to introduce a new Bida' due to relying upon a general hadeeth not knowing that it is specific, and this Bida' is none other than pointing with the finger in other than the sitting of Tashahhud!

Indeed there are two ahadeeth mentioned in 'Saheeh Muslim' about pointing in the sitting of Tashahhud, one of them, the hadeeth of Ibn Umar and the other hadeeth of Ibn az-Zubayr. Both have wordings which are general and specific or summarised and detailed: 'If the Messenger (صلى الله عليه وسلم) would sit in the prayer he would put his hands on his knees and raise his right finger which is next to his thumb and made Dua' during it...' so here the sitting is general.

And in the other narration: 'If he (صلى الله عليه وسلم) used to sit in Tashahhud he would place his left hand on his left knee and he would place his right hand on his right knee....' Until the end of the hadeeth.

So here the sitting is specific for Tashahhud. And the wording of the hadeeth of Ibn az-Zubayr is similar to this.

Legislation of placing hands on chest while standing before Rukoo' and not in the standing after

So in the first wording 'he sat' includes all sittings in the prayer, like the sitting between the two Sajdahs and sitting between the second Sajdah and the second Rak'ah which is well known to the scholars as the sitting for rest.

I used to say: we are about to see some of them point with their finger in these two sittings!!

And before long, it was said to me that some students point with their finger between the two Sajdahs (prostrations)! Then I saw this with my own two eyes, when one of the graduates from the Islaamic University did this when he visited me in my house in the beginning of the year 1404 A.H.

Then we were waiting for a third Bida' to be introduced; which was none other than pointing with the finger in the sitting for rest in the prayer! Then what we were waiting for took place and Allaah's aid is sought!

An example of this type of presumed summary for the legislation of pointing in the prayer is also in the hadeeth of Wa'il from the narration of 'Aasim bin Koolayb from his father from Wa'il, which is in 'Musnad Ahmad' (4/316-319) from two angles:

First angle: generally pointing in the prayer without restricting it to Tashahhud.

It is collected by Imaam Ahmad (4/116-117) from the way of Shu'ba from Wa'il with the wording:

'While sitting he (صلى الله عليه وسلم) spread his left thigh away from his right thigh and he pointed with his index finger.'

It is also collected by Ibn Khuzaimah in his 'Saheeh' (1/345/697); however he said at the end of it:

'I.e. in the sitting in Tashahhud.'

This explanation is either from Wa'il or from one of his narrators; the first one is the stronger opinion due to what follows.

And in another wording of Wa'il in 'al-Musnad' (4/316) from the narration of Abdulwahid with the wording:

'So when the Messenger (صلى الله عليه وسلم) sat he spread his left leg..... and he pointed with his index finger.'⁴

The second angle: Pointing restricted to the Tashahhud.

It is in 'al-Musnad' (4/319) from another chain from Shu'abah with the wording:

'So when he sat for Tashahhud... he pointed with his index finger and he linked the index finger in a circular form with the forefinger.'⁵

Abool-Ahwaas followed him up which is in Tahaawee in 'Sharh al-Ma'aanee' (1/152), and Tabaraanee in 'al-Mu'jam al-Kabeer' (22/34/80), with extra wording:

⁴ Ahmad followed him up (4/317 & 318) with Sufyaan Thawaree and Zuhayr bin Muwaweeyah and it was also collected by Tabaraanee 922/78, 83, 85, 90) from their chains and others.

⁵ Its Sanaad (chain) is authentic, and Ibn Khuzaimah also narrated it (698).

Legislation of placing hands on chest while standing before Rukoo' and not in the standing after

'then he began supplicating with the other.'

Zaidat bin Qadaamah followed them up with the wording:

'He (صلى الله عليه وسلم) made a circular ring, then he raised his finger, and I saw him move it and supplicate with it/during it.'⁶

Aboo 'Awwana followed them up with similar to it and in it is mentioned:

'then he supplicated'⁷

Tahaawee said commenting on the previous narration of Abool-Ahwaas:

'In this is the evidence that the Messenger (صلى الله عليه وسلم) was at the end of the prayer.'

I say: and this is clear in the narration of Aboo 'Awwana which was indicated to earlier, since he said:

'Then he made Sajdah (prostration) and placed his head on the floor between his hands, then he prayed another Rak'ah, then he sat and spread his left leg and then he supplicated and placed his left hand on his left knee, and his right hand on his right knee and supplicated with the index finger.'

And its Isnaad is Saheeh.

And likewise is the narration of Sufyaaan Ibn Uyaynah and his wording is:

'And if the Messenger (صلى الله عليه وسلم) sat in the two Rak'ah, he would recline his left leg and prop up his right leg, and he placed his right hand on his right thigh and raised his finger for the supplication and he placed his left hand on his left leg.'⁸

I say: so what becomes clear from these authentic narrations is that moving or pointing with the finger is indeed in the sitting of Tashahhud and unrestricted sitting as is mentioned in some of the narrations is restricted with the sitting in Tashahhud. This is what necessitates of the clarity from gathering and combining the narrations. The principle of carrying the unrestricted (Mutlaq) upon the restricted (muqayid) is reported in the science of Usool of Fiqh (science of Fiqh), that is why it has not been mentioned by anyone from the Salaf, of pointing unrestrictedly in the prayer nor in every sitting of the prayer as far as I know. And similarly it is said about placing the hands upon the chest and indeed it is in the standing in the prayer which is before the Rukoo' ', implementing the previously mentioned principle.

[The Reply to the narration of Abdurrazzaq]

If a person says: that Abdurrazzaq narrated from Thawree from 'Aasim bin Kulayb with a previous Isnaad from Wa'il and he mentioned the hadeeth and the spreading of his left leg in his sitting and said:

⁶ Collected by Aboo Daawood and by others from the collector of the Sunnan, and Ahmad (4/318), Tabaraanee (22/35/82) and Ibn Khuzaimah, Ibn Hibbaan, Ibn al-Jarood, Nawawee and Ibn al-Qayyim authenticated it, and it is researched in 'Saheeh Aboo Daawood' (717).

⁷ Collected by Tabaraanee (22/38/90) And by Ibn Idrees. likewise collected by Ibn Hibbaan (486) And by Salaam bin Sulaym by Tayyalisee (1020).

⁸ Collected by Nisaa'ee (1/173) with an authentic chain and by al-Humaydee (885) similarly.

Legislation of placing hands on chest while standing before Rukoo' and not in the standing after

'Then he pointed with his index finger and placing his thumb upon his middle finger making it in a circular form, and he clenched the rest of his fingers, then he prostrated (performed Sajdah) and his hands were opposite his ears (i.e. when he placed his hands on the floor).'

From the apparent meaning of the narration it indicates that the pointing was in the sitting between the two Sajdahs, due to him saying after mentioning the pointing:

'Then he prostrated...'

I say: Yes, Abdurrazzaq collected this in his 'Musannaf' (2/68-69), Imaam Ahmad narrated it upon him (4/317) and Tabaraanee in 'al-Mu'jam al-Kabeer' (2/34-35) and Shaykh Habibur-Rahman al-Azaamee claims in his comment upon this narration:

'That this narration was collected by the four Sunnan (Aboo Daawood, Nisaa'ee, Ibn Maajah & Tirmidhee), except that Tirmidhee and Baihaqee narrated it in a number of dispersed chapters.'

This claim is false, indicating his negligence, that what is obligatory to substantiate. Since not one of those who narrated it mentioned after pointing: 'Then he prostrated...'

Rather this is what Abdurrazzaq narrates from Thawree alone. And Muhammad bin Yusuf al-Faryyabee opposed him in this and he used to adhere to Thawree and he did not mention the prostration.⁹

Abdullaah bin al-Waleed followed him in narrating this: Sufyyaan narrated to me the same narration.¹⁰

Ibn al-Waleed is truthful but perhaps he made a mistake. His narration being followed up with the narration of al-Faryyabee for him is stronger than the narration of Abdurrazzaq, especially that they mention in his biography that he has ahadeeth which are not accepted from him; one of them is from his narration from Thawree, see 'Tahdheeb' by Ibn Hajr and 'Meezan' by Dhahabee, so these extra wordings are from his erroneous presumptions.

Indeed from what emphasises this, is that a large number from the Thiqaat (trustworthy) Huffaadh (memorisers) followed up Thawree in his narration which is preserved and from amongst those who preserved the narration are Abdulwahid bin Ziyaad, Shu'bah, Za'idah bin Qadaamah, Bashr bin al-Mufadal, Zuhayr bin Muaweeyah, Abool-Ahwaas, Aboo 'Awaanah, Ibn Idrees, Salaam bin Sulayman, Sufyyaan bin Uyaynah and other than them.

So all of these narrators did not mention this extra wording in the hadeeth of Wa'il, rather one of them mentioned it before pointing, like Bashr and Aboo 'Awaanah and other than these two and their wordings have preceded and some of them mentioned it clearly that the pointing was in the sitting of Tashahhud, as is preceded.

And this is what is correct, that which majority of the scholars from the Muhaditheen (Scholars of Hadeeth) and Fuqaha (Scholars of Fiqh) hold the opinion of. I do not know anyone who said that pointing with the finger is legislated in the sitting between the two Sajdahs except for Ibn al-Qayyim, since his apparent statement in 'Zaad al-Ma'ad' corresponding to the hadeeth of Abdurrazzaq.

⁹ This was collected by Tabaraanee (22/33/78).

¹⁰ Collected by Ahmad (4/318).

Legislation of placing hands on chest while standing before Rukoo' and not in the standing after

Perhaps that university student whom I indicated to earlier on, blindly followed him in this, or blindly followed those who blindly followed Ibn al-Qayyim from the present day scholars and I explained to him and other students who visited me the irregularity of the narration of Abdurrazzaq and its fragility.

One of those students informed me from one of the well-known scholars in some Arab lands that he implements this hadeeth of Abdurrazzaq and uses it as an evidence.

From this it indicates that he does not specialise in this knowledge, and this is what has compelled me to write this investigation and research, so if I was correct then it was from Allaah and if I was mistaken then it is from myself.

I ask al-Mawla (سبحانه وتعالى)¹¹ to take us by our hands and guide us to the truth which the people have differed in, indeed He guides who He Wills to the straight path and all praise belongs to Allaah the Lord of all the worlds.

[Taken from 'Silsilah Ahadeeth as-Saheehah' by Shaykh al-Albaanee (vol 5/2247)]

¹¹ (سبحانه وتعالى) (Subhanahu wa-ta'ala) May He be glorified and exalted